

**Information and Communications
Technology Applications in Support of
Municipal and Local Development
for the Government of Bolivia**

Enlared Municipal
www.enlared.org.bo

FINAL REPORT

Prepared for the U.S. Agency for International Development/Bolivia

February 24, 2003

International City/County Management Association

Contract No. LAG-I-00-99-00008-00 Task Order No. 810

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Proposed and Achieved Outcomes 2001-2002.....	3
Strategic Objective #1.....	3
Outcome 1.1 & Indicator 1.....	4
Outcome 1.1 & Indicator 2	5
Outcome 1.2 & Indicator 1	6
Outcome 1.3 & Indicator 1 a	7
Outcome 1.3 & Indicator 1 b	8
Outcome 1.4 & Indicator 1	9
Strategic Objective #2.....	10
Outcome 2.1 & Indicator 1	10
Strategic Objective #3.....	11
Outcome 3.1 & Indicator 1	11
Outcome 3.1 & Indicator 2	12
Activity Baselines and Advances 2001-2002.....	13
Product Baselines 2001-2002.....	15
Baseline Lessons Learned	16
Proposal for the Adjustment of the Terms of Reference.....	17
Appendix 1: Modification to the Terms of Reference	21

PROPOSED AND ACHIEVED OUTCOMES 2001-2002

STRATEGIC OBJECTIVE #1: Creation of a sustainable electronic information services platform that can generate useful and strategic services and information to assist affiliated municipalities to better respond to the needs and demands of their citizens.

Indicator 1: The Electronic Services Platform (ESP) was implemented to attend to the needs and demands of project counterparts, sectors involved in municipal activities, and the Bolivian Municipal Associative System. Once this information was compiled, the team worked on the Platform, taking into account the technological possibilities offered by the Chilean firm STI Soluziona. In August 2001, content was added to the ESP, services were developed and it was officially launched on the Web under the name *Enlared Municipal* (www.enlared.org.bo).

To ensure proper Platform operation, the counterparts received support for both technological infrastructure as well as training and technical assistance for their technicians. Each counterpart received multimedia materials for dissemination on the Portal and their services in their municipalities. The Portal and its services were introduced and implemented in each one of the municipal associations and a differentiated strategy was designed on the basis of an integrated plan for project sustainability.

OUTCOME 1.1 & INDICATOR 1

<p><u>Outcome 1.1:</u> An electronic services platform designed and developed in collaboration with AMT, AMDECRUZ, AMDECH, ACOBOL, FAM, and the Mancomunidad de la Gran Chiquitanía (MGCH)</p>	<p><u>Indicator No. 1:</u> Development of specific plans for specialized services and electronic resources, which are <u>designated, validated, and implemented</u> in cooperation with Mancomunidad de la Gran Chiquitanía, AMDECRUZ, AMDECH, ACOBOL, and FAM Bolivia, including a subsequent adaptation of new and existing content in various electronic formats.</p>
--	--

PLANNED Output / Products	ACHIEVED Output / Products 2001-2002	ADDITIONAL Achievements
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ⊖ Electronic Guide (Web sites, e-mail) ⊖ Publication of management instruments ⊖ Compilations of legislation ⊖ Space for FAQs ⊖ Campaign on Portal user benefits ⊖ Web sites developed and available on the Internet for MGCH, AMDECRUZ, AMT, AMDECH, and ACOBOL for month 12 as a function of the activities assigned to them for the Portal. 	<p>Organized in three areas (training, municipal management, and institutional and information services), to provide the following resources:</p> <p>Manuals, guides, and examples of management instruments.</p> <p>Municipal, national, and international legislation, comparative analysis, and legal comments.</p> <p>Frequently Asked Questions space operating.</p> <p>Web sites of all of the departmental associations of municipalities, ACOBOL and MGCH.</p>	<p>The Portal is presented to all of the country's departments (not just counterpart regions).</p> <p>The benefits of Enlared are disseminated in events held by ACOBOL, FAM, departmental associations (AADD), mancomunidades, DDPC, and municipalities.</p> <p>Web sites have been established for municipalities and developed by the counterparts (Porongo, Cotoca, El Alto, Puerto Suárez).</p>

OUTCOME 1.1 & INDICATOR 2

Taking into account the demand from Enlared Municipal counterparts and users, electronic services provided were developed based on the interactivity of the municipal community. Thus, ICMA Bolivia created areas for discussion and information that have operated since the Portal was originally launched. Within these spaces, Forums and Surveys were developed on topics current in municipal activity and specific Web Sites were set up for events, which allowed for further debate on their conclusions. Other products were also prepared for these ends. With regard to information dissemination, Enlared became the means for disseminating the FAM Bulletin through enlared.org.bo e-mail accounts. In addition, the platform incorporated current municipal legislation and information packets according to user demands.

Outcome 1.1: An electronic services platform designed and developed in collaboration with AMT, AMDECRUZ, AMDECH, ACOBOL, FAM, and the Mancomunidad de la Gran Chiquitanía (MGCH)	Indicator No. 2: Appropriate optimum formats and electronic mechanisms to create spaces for discussion on municipal governance, legislation, economic development, and citizen participation.
--	---

PLANNED Output / Products	ACHIEVED Output / Products 2001-2002	ADDITIONAL Achievements
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ⊖ Virtual discussion ⊖ Topics handled by listservs and electronic bulletin boards on political reform and participation. ⊖ Electronic information and consulting ⊖ Political news postings ⊖ Publication of electoral platforms ⊖ Information space (political, economic, and social) ⊖ Open tribune 	<p>Sixteen issues of the FAM Bulletin have been delivered via listserv that includes more than 1000 e-mail accounts corresponding to international donors, national government, related decentralized institutions, departmental associations (AADD), national and international municipal organizations.</p> <p>The Forum operates as a specialized arena for discussions and has held 10 discussions on specific topics (municipal transportation, gender violence, mancomunidades and their role, among others).</p> <p>A space has been created for political discussion (citizens' and voting rights).</p> <p>Consulting services have been set up in the following areas: Juridical, Environmental, and Gender.</p>	<p>A digital product has been established with information on the programs and electoral offerings of the political parties. It provides select information on areas of information technology and municipal proposals. It also allows discussion and analysis of preferences through on-line voting.</p>

OUTCOME 1.2 & INDICATOR 1

Within the framework of offering electronic resources that satisfy the needs of project counterparts, each municipal association assisted with the study of its requirements and the Platform's possibilities. The products resulting from this analysis were electronic bulletin boards, institutional agendas, calendars, etc. After some of the products were launched, it became evident that users did not satisfy the necessary conditions for their optimum use; this was the case, for example of the catalogue of vendors and suppliers. The product was unsustainable because of the lack of capacity among the counterparts themselves to access the required information. Products identified by the counterparts were evaluated, and in event that they were not deemed viable, they were substituted for more effective alternatives.

Outcome 1.2: An electronic services platform installed and operating / full incorporation of the three departmental municipal associations of Santa Cruz, Tarija, and Chuquisaca, as well as the Mancomunidad de la Gran Chiquitanía, ACOBOL, and FAM.

Indicator No 1: Set of electronic resources incorporated into the Portal and adapted to satisfy priority requirements of the Mancomunidad de la Gran Chiquitanía, AMDECRUZ, AMT, AMDECH, ACOBOL, and FAM.

PLANNED Output / Products	ACHIEVED Output / Products 2001-2002	ADDITIONAL Achievements
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ⊖ Institutional agendas for counterparts ⊖ Publication of managerial instruments. ⊖ Electronic space for social control ⊖ Query and opinion bulletin board, electronic guide (e-mails, Web sites of interest) ⊖ Catalogue of vendors / listing of suppliers ⊖ Publication of forms for municipal governance ⊖ Electronic queries on fiscal and tax topics ⊖ Tax calendar ⊖ Compilations of legislation ⊖ Multimedia training packets (off-line) 	<p>Institutional agendas have been included for those counterparts that provided information.</p> <p>The bulletin board has been established on the Portal as a space for opinion sharing and consultation.</p> <p>Information included for vendor catalogue and list of suppliers. After a year of operation, this space has been disabled and work has begun on the pilot project for electronic purchasing</p> <p>Information included for training and educational site links.</p> <p>Municipal information calendars included (taxes, report deadlines, AOPs and others).</p> <p>First multi-sectorial on-line conference, sponsored by MGCH in Puerto Suárez with the participation of the Armed Forces, private enterprise, civil society, and municipal authorities.</p> <p>Tutorials have been produced and placed on and off-line for users of "Real Info."</p>	<p>The Enlared network is contracted to disseminate the implementation of a Course on Municipal Governance, financed by Andean Development Corporation (CAF), to be carried out by George Washington University and UNIVALLE in Bolivia. This activity is linked to Enlared's goal to integrate activities related to financial sustainability and provide training information through the use of the Associative System.</p>

OUTCOME 1.3 & INDICATOR 1a

Activities carried out by ICMA aimed at covering Enlared's operating expenses had two areas of focus: revenues obtained from services provided and established in the Business Plan, and earnings generated by the exchange of services and strategic alliances.

In order to meet the objectives, ICMA developed a Business and Marketing Plan, which was explained and analyzed with each one of the counterparts and that included different assumptions for its achievement. It is worth noting that both ICMA and the counterparts sold advertisements to different firms and services to different international organizations and entrepreneurs. Additionally, services were exchanged with the media and other agencies.

<u>Outcome 1.3:</u> Sustainable financing for electronic Portal operation with gradual growth in coverage to 100% of cost after project completion in 22 months.	<u>Indicator No. 1a:</u> Projections for years 1 and 2 (partial) meet the minimum requirements for initial income generation. Adoption of a Business Plan before completing the project, which covers at least 2 years, including the initial projections and coverage on recurrent costs. Marketing Plan activities have been successfully carried out.
--	--

PLANNED Output / Products	ACHIEVED Output / Products 2001-2002	ADDITIONAL Achievements
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ⊖ Initial group of services established and available via Internet and other electronic formats. ⊖ Marketing Plan for Portal services developed as a key resource that illustrates and provides concrete guidelines. 	The Business Plan sets selling the image as the main product (strategic alliances with private sector and advertising). Additionally, ENLARED proposes selling information services to promote and disseminate technological applications.	<p>Paper products have been produced (flyers, posters, brochures). There have been mass media campaigns for TV and radio with national, departmental and local coverage (jingles and spots). Promotional material has been produced (key chains, mouse pads, etc.). FAM presents the Portal at international events (Colombia, Mexico, and others).</p> <p>Enlared assisted with the organization of the OAS' Hemispheric Meeting for Ministers and High-level Authorities Responsible for Decentralization Policies, Local Government, and Citizen Participation at the Municipal Level.</p>

OUTCOME 1.3 & INDICATOR 1b

Indicator 1b was not included in the Marketing Plan given the fact that the Municipal Associations themselves face minimum levels of collections on the part of their member municipalities. Furthermore, priority was given to establishing the provision of sustainable services offered through the Portal so that these services could generate income for the project. ICMA Bolivia understands sustainability as first, the provision of sustainable services, and then the development of additional tools.

Thus, Enlared has not received payments for user subscriptions and the policy adopted by FAM has been to subsidize services for municipalities, mancomunidades, and departmental associations (AADD) among the counterparts (first year) and for those who expressed obvious interest in working with the Portal (second year).

<u>Outcome 1.3:</u> Sustainable financing for electronic Portal operation with gradual growth in coverage to 100% of cost after project completion in 22 months.	<u>Indicator No. 1b:</u> Number of Municipalities and other clients with paid subscriptions for Platform access.
--	--

PLANNED Output / Products	ACHIEVED Output / Products 2001-2002	ADDITIONAL Achievements
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ⊖ A plan to cover the number of municipalities identified by each one of the Municipal Associations and the initial user universe ⊖ A listing of municipal supplies and services suppliers ⊖ Promotional activities carried out in collaboration with the Municipal Associations that participate in the electronic services platform 	<p>Direct marketing is carried out at events, workshops, seminars, courses, and municipal meetings, to promote the use and benefits of Enlared. Each presentation is carried out according to specific aspects of the Municipal AADD and the region.</p>	<p>ICMA Bolivia uses the Enlared Municipal Portal and USAID funds to strengthen pertinent Project counterparts and the Municipal Associative System, through the provision of grants to counterparts, enabling them to purchase computer equipment, as well as communications and technician salary expenses for each counterpart.</p>

OUTCOME 1.4 & INDICATOR 1

Ever since the Municipal Portal was launched, FAM and ACOBOL have used the platform to enhance their activities. This was the case for different forums initiated through the Portal in which both associations and their affiliates participated as moderators. Additionally, Enlared, FAM, and ACOBOL participated jointly in other parallel initiatives promoting Bolivian municipal development.

Outcome 1.4: Through FAM-Bolivia and ACOBOL, respectively, municipalities and councilwomen will enjoy greater involvement at the national level with regard to citizen participation and discussion of gender.	Indicator No. 1: A series of parallel initiatives were developed and launched by FAM and / or ACOBOL, to use different electronic media to enhance the participation of local actors involved in municipal management processes in Tarija, Santa Cruz, Chuquisaca, as well as with ACOBOL members in other departments.
--	---

PLANNED Output / Products	ACHIEVED Output / Products 2001-2002	ADDITIONAL Achievements
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ⊖ Two political initiatives at the national level, developed by FAM-Bolivia and / or ACOBOL using electronic media with the participation of at least 25% of the Tarija, Santa Cruz, and Chuquisaca municipalities and 10% of the councilwomen from other departments. ⊖ Diverse initiatives developed using different electronic resources, which are later given to credible and legitimate "sounding boards" such as the written press and electronic media, discussion groups, and other declarations of public opinion. 	<p>FAM has established different forums for discussion. In December 2001, a discussion forum was opened on the Portal with ACOBOL on the role of "Machismo in municipal democracy", which arose from sexual harassment experiences among municipal councilwomen.</p> <p>Support to the initiative "Youth Against Poverty" through the provision of training, e-mail accounts and an informative Web site.</p> <p>In order to contribute to municipal compliance with public policy on expenditures and investment, new digital applications have been produced for follow-up and control of tax co-participation resources and the relief of municipal debt.</p>	<p>Promotion and strengthening of Information Technology (IT) initiatives in Bolivia, such as those developed for Digital Government by PRONAGOB and by FUNDETIC.</p>

STRATEGIC OBJECTIVE #2: The Mancomunidad de la Gran Chiquitanía has greater capacity to identify and assist its municipalities through the use and active support of a database, which will monitor municipal performance in key areas (indicators to be defined in the work planning process) established by the database.

OUTCOME 2.1 & INDICATOR 1

Pursuant to the proposal for modification of the Terms of Reference proposed in the 2002 Work Plan dated March 5, 2002, this outcome was not taken into consideration for accomplishment (see modification to the Terms of Reference in Appendix I).

<u>Outcome 2.1:</u> The Mancomunidad de la Gran Chiquitanía has designed and put into operation an information system that allows ease of contact and updating with regard to municipal management in 9 of 14 municipalities.	<u>Indicator No. 1:</u> The Mancomunidad strengthens its annual Work Plan by identifying activities oriented to a pilot group of its municipalities. Best practices and innovative approaches are documented, analyzed, and presented on the basis of the information derived from the electronic resources provided by the platform.
---	---

PLANNED Output / Products	ACHIEVED Output / Products 2001-2002	ADDITIONAL Achievements
⊖ A system capable of recording advances in municipal management with regard to different municipal operating plans and that furthermore compiles information on the different types of citizen participation at the local level.	Not applicable (NA)	NA

STRATEGIC OBJECTIVE #3: A series of lessons learned, norms and strategies on how to encourage community and municipal participation in the use of these electronic tools in the 6 departments not considered in this project.

OUTCOME 3.1 & INDICATOR 1

As a part of the original group of counterparts, AMDECRUZ and the Mancomunidad de la Gran Chiquitanía were assisted with both infrastructure and technical training and assistance. In addition to developing Web sites for two counterparts, ICMA Bolivia participated in and provided support to different activities in the Department to promote the Portal.

<u>Outcome 3.1:</u> Group of lessons / best practices learned, guides and strategies on how to use the service platform to strengthen community participation, in coordination with the municipalities of Gran Chiquitanía and AMDECRUZ.	<u>Indicator No. 1:</u> A significant number of municipalities in Santa Cruz formally adopt an effective communication and marketing strategy to sponsor and strengthen their capacities through the use of the electronic platform's services.
--	---

PLANNED Output / Products	ACHIEVED Output / Products 2001-2002	ADDITIONAL Achievements
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ⊖ Training activities and technical assistance carried out by a select group of municipalities in Santa Cruz to extend the user base. ⊖ Traditional services adapted or modified to electronic formats. ⊖ Electronic Portal content reflects an increase in information contributions and other inputs from a select group of municipalities. ⊖ A study of the interactions with the list of suppliers. 	<p>In order to extend the Portal's user base, it has been introduced in different types of events (Santa Cruz Fair, La Paz Municipal Fair, Sucre Business Fair).</p> <p>The Portal has more than 10,000 pages of information and it is constantly updated. New pages, such as the CD Library, Events and Links, have been created.</p>	<p>The Mancomunidad de la Gran Chiquitanía uses its e-mail accounts on enlared.org.bo to promote its handicrafts and tourism.</p> <p>Enlared Municipal sponsors the CD from the Mancomunidad de la Gran Chiquitanía.</p>

OUTCOME 3.1 & INDICATOR 2

The six project counterparts have introduced the use of new technologies through Enlared Municipal. This use was reflected by the increased use of e-mail for inter-association communications. Furthermore, the counterparts found a participatory space through forums, surveys, and queries, by email. ICMA Bolivia required additional time not foreseen in the Terms of Reference to train counterpart technicians. It is worth noting that technological know-how is still fairly undeveloped in Bolivia.

<u>Outcome 3.1:</u> Group of lessons / best practices learned, guides and strategies on how to use the service platform to strengthen community participation validated and replicated, in coordination with the municipalities of the Mancomunidad de la Gran Chiquitanía and AMDECRUZ.	<u>Indicator No. 2:</u> Number of municipalities in Tarija, Santa Cruz and Chuquisaca, which have adopted and introduced the use of best technologies for communications and information.
--	---

PLANNED Output / Products	ACHIEVED Output / Products 2001-2002	ADDITIONAL Achievements
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ⊖ Electronic discussions (chat rooms) sponsored by the Platform, on the best practices for municipal / local development applying new technologies. ⊖ User manuals and other educational tools on platform resources. ⊖ Different options for queries from Platform users and institutional facilitators. 	<p>Enlared has sponsored more than 15 forums with an average of between 10 and 15 participants each. The topics have focused on constitutional reform, land reform movements, new technologies, and local development, resources for co-participation, social control, mancomunidades and their role, among others.</p> <p>All counterpart technicians have been trained with regard to the tools and use of the ESP, information provision, and drafting of news items for the Internet Portal. Manuals and guides have been prepared.</p>	<p>Sites have been prepared to present activities in quasi-real time, such as seminars, courses, or workshops. In this mode, work has been carried out in the Departmental Associations (single nominee candidates respond to questions organized by AMDEPAZ, ACOBOL, and DDPC itself {Workshop on Health Management, for example}).</p>

ACTIVITY BASELINES AND ADVANCES 2001-2002

TOPIC	DESCRIPTION
Central Project Activities	<p>January – December 2001</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Development and approval of the 2001 Work Plan (Quarter I) ▪ Digital Development for the Portal according to the 2001 Work Plan (Quarter I) ▪ Mass dissemination campaign, reporting Portal launch (Quarter III) ▪ Official Portal launch (Quarter III - August 16, 2001) ▪ Consolidation of content within the Portal (Quarter III)
Specific Activities	<p>January – December 2001</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Evaluation of project technological requirements (Quarter I, March 2001) 2. Selection of the office, acquisition of furnishings and supplies, and start-up for activities (Quarter I) 3. Selection and hiring of Bolivian personnel (Quarter I) 4. Development and approval of the Work Plan (Quarter I) 5. Identification and hiring of institutional coordinators (I Quarter) 6. Discussions with FAM on ownership and operation of the Portal (Quarter I) 7. Training Seminar for counterpart technicians (August 17, 2001) 8. Launch of Enlared Municipal in each one of the project's counterpart municipal associations (Quarter III, September 2001) 9. Start-up of the Internet server (Quarter III) 10. Preparation and start-up of the Business Plan (Quarter III) 11. Consideration of electronic applications / tools for the Portal (detailed in the 2001 Work Plan) as a response to needs and services identified by each institutional counterpart (Quarter I) 12. Joint working and consultation sessions at a distance with STI, S.A. on Portal layout and design (Quarter I) 13. First Multi-Sectorial Summit on the Internet, sponsored by the Municipalities of the Chiquitania Commonwealth and the Puerto Suárez Mayor's Office (Quarter III, October 5, 2001) 14. Meeting of Ministers and High Level Authorities Responsible for Decentralization, Local Government, and Citizen Participation Policies (Quarter III, July 2001) 15. E-mail accounts go online on the Portal server for each member municipality of the Santa Cruz, Tarija, and Chuquisaca municipal associations. Similarly, e-mails were established for other municipalities, other users, and association members. (Quarter III) 16. Contact with strategic clients that can provide support, in order to start-up the Business Plan (Quarter III) 17. Incorporation of Portal content, also establishing a routine with technicians from the counterparts to send information and keep it updated (Quarter III)

TOPIC	DESCRIPTION
Central Project Activities	<p>January – September 2002</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Development and approval of the 2002 Work Plan (Quarter V, March 5, 2002) ▪ Contacts and strategic alliances to carry out on-line bidding (Quarter V) ▪ Populating Enlared with new content and services. (Quarter V) ▪ Opening the universe of users: Municipalities, Associations, and Commonwealths (Quarter VI) ▪ Constitution of the Advisory Committee for Enlared Municipal (Quarter V, March 21, 2002) ▪ Attendance and Support of the Technology Forum – FUNDETIC (Quarter VII, July 2002) ▪ Signed an agreement with the Mayor's Office from Porongo (Santa Cruz): Pilot Project for municipal procedures on Internet (Quarter VII) ▪ Activities for the Enlared anniversary (Quarter VII, August 16, 2002)
Specific Activities	<p>January – September 2002</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. First National Workshop on Evaluation of Enlared Municipal (Quarter V) 2. Preparation of an adequate scenario for the implementation of on-line bidding (Quarter V, March 2002) 3. Reconfiguration of the Web servers and e-mail to improve service for the users and resolve technical limitations (Quarter V) 4. Agreements with different sectors and negotiations to direct on-line bidding (Quarter VI) 5. Incorporation of new content and digital applications (1) Mini-website on presidential elections; (2) Interactive course on "Real Info"; and (3) construction of the CD library compiling CDs of interest to Enlared users (Quarter VI) 6. Initial work on managing the new G-Central platform (Quarter VI) 7. Coordination with the Municipal Development Ministry: Enlared will be the sole Internet Portal for the country's municipalities (Quarter VII) 8. Activities to strengthen the relationship between FAM and Enlared (Quarter VII) 9. Enlared consolidated the relationship with the rest of the associations through service provision (Quarter VII) 10. Organization of a booth in the Santa Cruz Exposition Fair – FEXPO (Quarter VII) 11. Presentation of the project to the US Ambassador (Quarter VI, April 18, 2002)

PRODUCT BASELINES 2001-2002

TOPIC	DESCRIPTION
Products January – December 2001	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Electronic applications/tools for the Portal specified in the 2001 Work Plan (Quarter I) 2. Mass dissemination campaign, reporting on the launch of the Portal (Quarter III) 3. Official Launch of the Portal (Quarter III, August 16, 2001)
Products January – September 2002	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Electronic bulletin from Enlared Municipal (Distributed by e-mail, Quarter V) 2. @OP (PO@) (Proposal for a digital AOP [Annual Operating Plan], Quarter V) 3. PAI (Proposal for a digital PAI, Quarter V) 4. Electronic bidding (Proposal for Quarter V, April 2002) 5. Creation of the Claims Window (Quarter VII) 6. Development of different applications and new digital content: Mini-web site on presidential elections; Interactive course on "Real Info"; construction of the CD library; compiling material of interest for Enlared users; FAM bulletins; evaluation of the decentralized administration of the Website with the Mancomunidad de la Gran Chiquitanía; reinstallation and reconfiguration on the Web server (Quarter VI & VII)

LESSONS LEARNED

TOPIC	DESCRIPTION
<i>...on association development and the relationship of associations to the project</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - There has been unequal development in each of the associations, which can be seen in their different dynamics, strengths and abilities. This heterogeneity requires a differentiated interaction with each one. - It is of utmost importance to establish new agreements with other counterparts, in order to open, insofar as possible, the universe of eligible project partners. It is also necessary to restate the terms of the relationship with the counterparts, in order to ensure a wider spectrum of variation in the assistance provided by the project and the role played by its partners.
<i>...on the role of associations and their ability to act as assistants and intermediaries</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Their current role is essentially representative, without a true capacity for carrying out sustainable technical assistance efforts. It is important to emphasize the value of the technical intervention and interaction model with the associations. This would ensure the sustainability and expansion of their technical assistance capabilities. - The intermediation carried out by municipal associations and mancomunidades regarding governmental agencies, NGOs, development projects, and other agencies and initiatives is, in many cases, artificial and does not respond to natural municipal dynamics. The Portal should contribute to the insertion and consolidation of this intermediation. - The technical personnel of the associations do not have the skills necessary for Portal development and maintenance. Thus, the tasks of updating and expanding the content continue to be centralized in the Project and therefore are supply-side and not demand-driven. The Portal should be both a vehicle and a promoter of professional development in the associations.
<i>...on the factors outside the process, the outcomes, and the demand</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The pilot on-line bidding project will require more preparatory activity, both with regard to negotiations with competent governmental sectors and the dissemination and promotion within the universe of local level participants. - The Bolivian electoral process during 2002 was, without a doubt, a critical factor in the efficiency and efficacy of the interchange with municipal associations and FAM. It is important to keep in view the vulnerability of the working agendas of the associations to debate and political agitation, both locally and nationally. - The objectives of Enlared Municipal should be defined on the basis of achievements within a possible Phase II of the Project. This is especially important to avoid unachievable expectations within resource levels and terms set for a future phase of Portal operations. - The proposed outcomes, their indicators, and accomplishment benchmarks should better reflect the knowledge acquired in the first phase of the true conditions found within Bolivia, in particular within the local governance community. - The demand recorded at the end of the first phase of Portal operations surpasses the human and financial resources assigned in this phase. It becomes necessary, therefore, to carefully consider the projection of this demand into a second phase of project execution.

I. PROPOSAL FOR THE ADJUSTMENT OF THE TERMS OF REFERENCE

Project No. 814 ICMA IQC No. OUT-LAG-I-819-99-00008-00

ICMA proposes the following changes to the original terms of reference:

1.4 WORK CONTENT

- We propose to eliminate paragraph 4, which begins with “Under the Project, a pilot activity will also be carried out with the Mancomunidad de la Gran Chiquitanía,” as well as paragraph 5, which begins with “The local municipal contribution” Outcome No. 2 would also be eliminated.

ICMA considered from the outset that the work with the six Project counterparts was a part of the Enlared Municipal Pilot Project. Although the Mancomunidad was not dealt with as exclusively as foreseen in the description in the terms of reference, the Mancomunidad did receive attention along with its municipalities in training, dissemination of Enlared, and direct support through a contract that allowed the Mancomunidad to purchase equipment, ensure connectivity to Internet, and commit technical personnel to act as links between the Mancomunidad and the Portal. ICMA also made an effort to include the connectivity requirements of the Mancomunidad in several meetings with national agencies in the telecommunications sector. With regard to the use of the Mancomunidad as a base for lessons learned to validate promotional material and best practices, we have seen that the level of connectivity in the Mancomunidad (as well as in the rest of the counterparts) is insufficient to use the Mancomunidad as a model or best practice for strategy development. For this reason it becomes necessary to eliminate the reference to the Mancomunidad as a Pilot Project, and leave it as part of the Project on an equal footing with the rest of the counterparts mentioned in the initial Terms of Reference.

The second paragraph refers to the municipalities within the Mancomunidad which, aside from the fact that not all of them can provide the physical space, computers, Internet connections, and technicians to promote the use of Enlared, goes against our objective of first strengthening the associations and through them the municipalities.

Outcome No. 2 indicates that at the end of the Project, the Mancomunidad should have better capabilities for identifying and assisting the municipalities through the use and active support of a database. This activity falls outside the realm of Enlared Municipal and requires additional personnel to be able to work directly with the Mancomunidad in identifying indicators of municipal governance. Furthermore, it is an activity that the Mancomunidad itself should emphasize, and take the initiative with its member municipalities in obtaining a consensus on the indicators and the population of the database with concrete outcomes for measurement. Enlared could provide the tools to establish the database and publish it on Enlared as a service, but it cannot do this without an intensive collaborative effort on the part of the Mancomunidad. Thus, we recommend that ICMA not be assigned a responsibility that does not concern it through this outcome.

STRATEGIC OBJECTIVE #1

- In outcome 1.1, we propose to add players, such as the municipalities and mancomunidades and we want to emphasize that the platform was developed in cooperation with the players indicated at the outset, but also with a wider group of associations.

Outcome 1.1 revised: An electronic platform has been designed and developed, consisting of Web sites, virtual libraries, databases, news of municipal interest, specialized training and technical assistance, seminars, virtual discussion groups (chat rooms), best practices, specialized information and legal consulting, laws, etc., in cooperation with ***the municipalities, mancomunidades, municipal associations, and the Bolivian Federation of Municipal Associations.***

- In outcome 1.2, we want to emphasize that the platform was not conceived as a network among three departmental municipal associations, a mancomunidad, and ACOBOL and FAM, but rather that it was conceived as a network that responds not only to the needs for services and information of the aforementioned counterparts, but also the whole set of municipal players in the country. In this sense, we have eliminated the specific reference to the initial counterparts.

Outcome 1.2 revised: An electronic services platform (network) has been installed and is in operation.

- In outcome 1.3, we feel that, due to factors outside the scope of the project, such as the state of the economy and the lack of a national policy to support the telecommunications sector (to rapidly improve the country's connectivity), among others, ICMA sees the need to eliminate the goal of financing 100% of Portal operation. We feel that it is not feasible that by the date of the conclusion of the current contract, 100% of the operating costs can be achieved. Our experience indicates that we must be more conservative in our estimates and we believe that it is necessary to extend the term foreseen to achieve that sustainability.

Outcome 1.3 revised: Models of content and sustainable financing have been created to gradually cover the recurring expenses of the electronic services platform and the basic information requirements after Project termination.

- With regard to the performance benchmarks, we propose the following modification:
One income voucher through month 12, and 14 income vouchers through month 21.
- Under outcome 1.3, we propose to eliminate indicator #1B, since the percentage of municipalities connected to Internet is much lower than had been anticipated, especially in the departments of Tarija, Chuquisaca, and Santa Cruz. We cannot demand that the municipalities pay subscriptions to Enlared when they don't have connectivity.
- Under indicator No. 2 of Outcome 1.4, ICMA proposes to change the indicator in such a way that it will better reflect the reality of the connectivity shortage in Bolivia. For example, we cannot expect that 50% of the municipalities of the Mancomunidad de la Gran Chiquitanía subscribe and utilize the Portal when less than 30% of the municipalities have connectivity. We also propose changing the unit of frequency with a survey that Enlared will carry out with the universe mentioned at the end of the Project.

Indicator #2 revised: At least 50% of the municipalities in the Mancomunidad de la Gran Chiquitanía, 25% of the municipalities in 3 of the 9 Bolivian Departments and 25% of the councilwomen **from among those with connectivity** have entered and used the Electronic Services Platform and have understood the ways in which the platform might lower costs on the basis of improved cost-performance relationships (and / or improved municipal governance or service provision).

Revised frequency: Once, at the end of the Project.

- In the description of the critical tasks under Strategic Objective No. 1, ICMA proposes to eliminate the phrase “the contractor will implement access to Internet and the information technology platform”, since, as we explained above, that it is not possible to ensure the connection to Internet for Enlared users. We also wish to eliminate the last phrase of the paragraph, since it was found that “Real Mail” was not an adequate Portal tool.

Critical tasks under Strategic Objective No. 1 revised:

The Contractor will assist FAM-Bolivia to prepare a technological platform, organize the ESP equipment; design the specifications regarding functional requirements and platform graphics and content, in close coordination with the selected municipalities, the Mancomunidad de la Gran Chiquitanía, AMDECRUZ, AMDECH, AMT, ACOBOL, and FAM. The Contractor will draft a communications and marketing plan and a financing strategy; it will evaluate the informational requirements of the municipality and its citizens, obtain and validate the information; incorporate / load the databases, and make all necessary tests of the Web site before launching the program. Finally, the Contractor will implement complementary applications, such as e-mail, discussion groups (chat rooms), etc., and will introduce additional services such as “Real Quest” or a “virtual consulting process”, needed to draft policies. **The Contractor will implement services related to on-line purchase and sales.**

- ICMA proposes eliminating Strategic Objective No. 2, for the reasons indicated in the first part of the document, Strategic Objective No. 2 below corresponds to Strategic Objective No. 3 in the original Terms of Reference.

STRATEGIC OBJECTIVE #2

A series of lessons, norms, and strategies learned on how to promote community and municipal participation in the use of these electronic tools in the 6 departments not considered under this Project.

Outcome 2.1:	A set of lessons learned / best practices, norms, and strategies on how to promote municipal and community participation in the use of the Electronic Services Platform to support local and municipal development.
Indicator #1:	A significant number of municipalities in the Departments of Tarija, Chuquisaca, and Santa Cruz and the Mancomunidad de la Gran Chiquitanía formally adopt an adequate communications / marketing strategy to promote municipal and communal participation for the use of the Electronic Services Platform.
Unit of Measurement:	Approved communications / marketing plans.
Frequency:	After 12 months of project execution.
Baseline:	0
Performance Benchmarks:	Ten percent of the municipalities of the target group with adequate connectivity by month 15; 20% by month 18; 30% by the end of the project.
Relationship to Mission Outcomes:	IR3

CORE ACTIVITIES AND PROGRESS 2001/2002

Indicator #2:	Number of municipalities in Tarija, Santa Cruz, and Chuquisaca, that have adapted and introduced the use of best practices in communications and information technology.
Unit of Measurement:	Records on use / surveys.
Frequency:	Once through month 12 and again by month 18.
Baseline:	0
Performance Benchmarks:	To be defined under the contractor's annual work plan.
Relationship to Mission Outcomes:	IR3

Critical tasks under Strategic Objective No. 2:

The Contractor will be responsible for reproducing the best practices in three department municipal associations (Santa Cruz, Tarija, and Chuquisaca). The key project personnel, including the Project Manager, will be trained by the sub-contractor in the use of the ESP with regard to technical and information services and in the use of information technology for development. At the same time, the same trained personnel will provide most of the technical assistance in the participating municipalities.

- In the last section of the Terms of Reference, ICMA proposes to eliminate the first phrase of the last paragraph, since current connectivity in Bolivia is not limited to the Mancomunidad de la Gran Chiquitanía.

APPENDIX 1: MODIFICATION TO THE TERMS OF REFERENCE

STRATEGIC OBJECTIVE	ORIGINAL	RESTATED
STRATEGIC OBJECTIVE #1	The creation of a sustainable electronic information services platform, which can generate and administer useful and strategic services and information to assist the affiliated municipalities to better respond to the needs and demands of their citizens.	The creation of a sustainable electronic information services platform, which can generate and administer useful and strategic services and information to assist the affiliated municipalities to better respond to the needs and demands of their citizens.
	<u>Outcome 1.1:</u> An electronic platform has been designed and developed, consisting of Web sites, virtual libraries, databases, news of municipal interest, specialized training and technical assistance, seminars, virtual discussion groups (chat rooms), best practices, specialized information and legal consulting, laws, etc., in cooperation with the Mancomunidad de la Gran Chiquitanía, AMDECRUZ, AMT, ACOBOL, and FAM.	<u>Outcome 1.1:</u> An electronic platform has been designed and developed, consisting of Web sites, virtual libraries, databases, news of municipal interest, specialized training and technical assistance, seminars, virtual discussion groups (chat rooms), best practices, specialized information and legal consulting, laws, etc., in cooperation with the municipalities, mancomunidades, municipal associations, and FAM.
	<u>Outcome 1.2:</u> An electronic services platform (network) has been installed and is in operation in and among the three departmental associations of municipalities in Santa Cruz, Tarija, Chuquisaca, the Mancomunidad de la Gran Chiquitanía, ACOBOL, and FAM.	<u>Outcome 1.2:</u> An electronic services platform (network) has been installed and is in operation.
	<u>Outcome 1.3:</u> Models of content and sustainable financing have been created to gradually cover 100% of the recurring expenses of the electronic services platform and the basic information requirements after Project termination.	<u>Outcome 1.3:</u> Models of content and sustainable financing have been created to gradually cover 100% of the recurring expenses of the electronic services platform and the basic information requirements after Project termination.
	<u>Outcome 1.4:</u> Through FAM and ACOBOL, municipalities and councilwomen are participating more actively in the design of gender and decentralization policies.	<u>Outcome 1.4:</u> Through the municipal mancomunidades, FAM and ACOBOL, municipalities and councilwomen are participating more actively in the design of gender and decentralization policies.

STRATEGIC OBJECTIVE #2	The Mancomunidad de la Gran Chiquitanía has greater capacity for identifying and assisting the municipalities through the use and active support of a database, which monitors municipal performance in key areas (indicators to be defined in the work planning process) established under the database.	Impossible to implement; it became necessary to modify (see the modification of the terms of reference).
	<u>Outcome 2.1:</u> The Mancomunidad de la Gran Chiquitanía has designed and put into operation an information system, which allows it to monitor municipal performance and better orient its technical assistance and other services.	
STRATEGIC OBJECTIVE #3	A series of lessons, norms, and strategies learned on how to promote community and municipal participation in the use of these electronic tools in the 6 departments not considered under this Project.	A series of lessons, norms, and strategies learned on how to promote community and municipal participation in the use of these electronic tools in the 6 departments not considered under this Project.
	<u>Outcome 3.1:</u> A set of lessons learned / best practices, norms, and strategies on how to promote municipal and community participation in the use of the Electronic Services Platform to support local and municipal development, validated and replicated in coordination with the municipalities of Gran Chiquitanía and AMDECRUZ.	<u>Outcome 3.1:</u> A set of lessons learned / best practices, norms, and strategies on how to promote municipal and community participation in the use of the Electronic Services Platform to support local and municipal development.